

**3** OPEN ACCESS

# Portrait of Moderation Internalization in the Poems of KH. A. Mustofa Bisri in Poetry Appreciation Study Course

Sri Lestari<sup>1</sup> Siti Nur Aini Amaliyah<sup>2</sup> Dina Maftuh<sup>3</sup>

<sup>1,2,3</sup> Postgraduate Management of Islamic Education, UIN Raden Mas Said Surakarta, Sukoharjo, Indonesia

#### **ABSTRACT**

The study of poetry appreciation requires the internalization of religious moderation to support the continuity of literary learning at state religious universities. One of the writers, humanists who pay attention to moderation and critics of this country is KH. A. Mustofa Bisri or commonly known as Gus Mus. This study aims to describe the portrait of the internalization of religious moderation in the poems of KH. A. Mustofa Bisri in the poetry appreciation study course at the Indonesian Language Tadris Study Program, Faculty of Adab and Language, UIN Raden Mas Said Surakarta. The portrait of internalization is seen from the point of view of the meaning of poetry and then seen from the observation sheets that have been made by students in appreciating their friends' poetry readings. This research is a qualitative research with data collection techniques in the form of observation, interviews, content analysis and documentation. The data in this study are the results of interviews, poetry reading observation sheets, documentation in class and content analysis of Gus Mus's poems with the theme of moderation. The sampling technique in this study uses purposive sampling, while the validation technique uses triangulation of theories and methods. The data analysis technique used the Miles and Hubermann interactive model. The results showed that there were values of tawasuth, tasamuh, tawazun, and I'tidal in Gus Mus's poems with the theme of moderation. In addition, there are principles against religious moderation. In relation to teaching poetry appreciation, understanding.

#### **KEYWORDS**

Moderation; poetry; appreciation

Received: 1 November 2022 Accepted: 26 November 2022 Published: 30 Januari 2023

#### Introduction

Religious moderation in learning is something that is echoed by the Ministry of Religion. This was conveyed by Minister of Religion Yaqut Cholis Qoumas in the Lauching of the Religious Moderation Action Program in Schools and Madrasahs Wednesday, September 22, 2021, at the Ministry of Religion Building, Jl. MH Thamrin No. 6 Jakarta. In this case Gus Yaqut received support from the Minister of Education and Culture Nadiem Makarim. According to Nadiem, one of the sins in education in Indonesia is intolerance. Currently, the Minister of Religion and the Minister of Education and Culture are trying to insert the topic of diversity and values of religious moderation in schools.

Naj'ma (2021) explained that formal educational institutions are the right target to internalize religious moderation due to the existence of a systemic, structured and evaluative learning space. The urgency of religious moderation according to Yanti (2020) refers to current national problems such as economic inequality, cultural disparities, ethnic and religious sentiments and the threat of conflict that can only be resolved through cooperation with the principle of mutual understanding between religious communities. Through the moderation of Islamic pluralism, plurality, or diversity that has become a necessity, can be used as universal energy to unravel the problems of the Indonesian nation today (Amrin et al., 2020; Baidi et al., 2020; Fernando et al., 2022).

Students have not fully realized the importance of religious moderation in daily life. This was also conveyed by Ali (2020) who stated that students were not sufficiently familiar with the tag line "religious moderation", and the provision of religious moderation material in the form of socialization or scientific discussion forums was still limited. Even though according to Herlinawati (2020), the values of religious moderation have been integrated in IRE learning at State Universities through materials related to tolerance, brotherhood (ukhuwah), and the concept of Islamic teachings as the religion of rahmatan lil 'alamin. The alternative of religious moderation was also formulated by

**CONTACT** Sri Lestari

m sri.lestari@iain-surakarta.ac.id

Suryadi (2022) especially in Islamic religious education carried out by integrating three strategies consisting of curriculum, learning and strengthening the moderation paradigm.

However, it is appropriate if religious moderation is also internalized into general courses at universities within the Ministry of Religion. One of the courses is related to literature, especially poetry. Gus Mus's poems contain many elements of religion and tolerance. Dimyati (2018) said that the Islamic moderation perspective of Ahmad Mustofa Bisri is closely related to the values of Pancasila and is very relevant to his idea of always being committed to maintaining the diversity of the nation and state. Ahmad Mustofa Bisri's advices, which are full of wisdom and inspiration for his thoughts in various lines of life, are thoughts that are very much needed by the nation's children in facing the challenges of the times. In addition, Gus Mus's poems according to Ulistiani et al (2018) contain elements of truth, carry a message of peace, do not conflict with universal values, provide convenience for the recipient of the message. This is appropriate to be applied as a form of internalization of poetry learning in Islamic religious colleges.

### Literature review

### **Religious Moderation**

Moderation or wasath or wasathiyah means the middle, fair (I'tidal) and balanced (tawazun). The principles of moderation in Islam according to (Hasan, 2020):

## a. Justice ('Is)

Fair means the same, but the same here is defined as impartial and one-sided, on the side of the truth, and does not act arbitrarily. Fair is the embodiment of balance and equality that a person gets, both in terms of rights and obligations.

## b. Balance (Tawazun)

This balance is based on reason which must uphold rationality. This balanced attitude can be interpreted as behavior that is not extreme, not excessive, not liberal, and acts naturally.

## c. Tolerance (Tasamuh)

Religion is understood not only as a teaching but also as a rule. Religion should facilitate and provide convenience. Tolerance means acting and allowing, letting, respecting the stances, views, beliefs, opinions, behavior and habits of others. Tolerance does not mean that it is interpreted as a weakly submissive attitude without principles, but rather that one has to have a strong faith and noble Shari'a. In Islam, what is meant by tolerance is not theological tolerance, but in the socialist realm. The realm of tolerance is to appreciate, not justify or follow it. Tolerance is based on a pluralistic society, according to UNESCO, tolerance is an attitude of mutual acceptance, respect, respect for the diversity of freedom, culture and ways of expression and the character of each individual.

## **Poetry Learning**

Writing poetry is a way to express, express the author's ideas or thoughts. In expression writers/poets need inspiration and artistic experience. States that in writing poetry some concrete experiences are needed as a source of initial inspiration. Some models of writing poetry as follows.

- a. By emotively describing concrete objects, for example mountains, oceans, rainbows, clouds, stars and the moon.
- b. By describing personal names, for example regarding one's own experiences, one's state when the poem was created, as well as dreams and aspirations.
- c. By writing about figures in history, mythology or other literary works. For example, Diponegoro, Jalaluddin Rumi, puppet characters and so on.

Steps in writing poetry according to Endraswara (2003) includes three stages, namely: the first step is doing sensing, the second step is doing contemplation, and the third step is doing word games.

- a. Sensing: one needs to do sensing first to the object, it can be nature, or other objects. In this digitalization era, sensing can also be done by watching videos online.
- b. Do the contemplation stage. One's contemplation is influenced by each person's intuition to build concepts and imagination
- c. Playing word games: in this stage someone composes poetry by paying attention to language style and typography. The production of poetry is a representation of the previous stages.

This study is a qualitative research on the use of moderation poems in poetry appreciation study lectures at the Tadris Indonesian Language Study Program, Faculty of Adab and Language, UIN Raden Mas Said Surakarta with a student population of 121 divided into 4 classes. The data in this study are poems with the theme of moderation used in lectures. Data collection techniques were carried out by means of content analysis, documentation, observation and unstructured interviews. The data in this study were the results of interviews, poetry reading observation sheets, documentation in class and content analysis of Gus Mus's poems with the theme of moderation. The sampling technique in this study uses purposive sampling, or a purposive sample. The sample used is only an observation sheet containing religious moderation. The data validation technique uses triangulation of methods and theories, while the data analysis technique uses Miles and Hubermann's interactive model.

#### **Results**

Based on the data collection in this study, several things were found that need attention. There are values of *Tawasuth, Tawazun, I'tidal* and *Tasamuh* in Gus Mus' poems. In addition, there was also an attitude against the concept of religious moderation which was still practiced by the community. The teaching of poetry appreciation in the fourth grade, namely 5A, 5B, 5C, 5D examines Gus Mus's poems with the title Religion, Religious People of this Country, When Religion Lost God, Allahu Akbar and I still memorized the song very well.

#### Discussion

Religious Poetry by KH. A. Mustofa Bisri contains about religion which is described like a golden chariot. Religion which is a system of belief and worship of God is likened to a chariot or a vehicle to reach His presence (God). Humans are likened to being on a chariot that will take them to God, but because of their greed and sense of individualism, they actually fight with each other to get to the front seat.

#### Tawasuth (Being in the middle)

In the poem entitled Religion, being in the middle can be interpreted as religion is used as a tool to deliver a moral message that in religion humans should not be too right (fundamental) or left (liberal). Humans are also not allowed to disbelieve each other to appear to be the foremost/pious. The spread of religion to the extreme is against this principle. Gus Mus's poems teach people to use religion as a vehicle to gain His pleasure without the need to drop and disbelieve one another. Humans do not need to be busy fighting each other to be the most correct, the best, in fact it even distances humans from His pleasure. Whereas religion is broad and flexible for those who understand and really long for His pleasure. This is in accordance with the following stanza of the poem.

This means that in the poetry of religious people in this country, humans are fighting for the nearest place by His side even by 'poking/stabbing' their own brother. The word 'poke and stab' here means to drop, insult, even indirectly disbelieve one's own brother in order to be able to be closest to God. They look pious in front of humans but are actually despots. They oppose the principle of tawassuth (being in the middle) in religious moderation which clearly cannot be too right (fundamental) or left (liberal). Spreading religion to the extreme is against this principle.

#### Tasamuh (tolerance)

Tolerance can be seen from the verse 'Moreover, until the brothers themselves fight for the front place', in this case humans are expected to be able to appreciate the differences that exist. Both differences of opinion within the same religion as well as differences between religions. So that they don't 'battle' over religion and compete to be at the forefront. The Poetry of the Religions of this Country by KH. A. Mustofa Bisri contains a deep meaning about religious people in Indonesia. This can be seen from the meaning of each of the following stanzas of the poem.

Tuhan, lihatlah betapa kaum beragama negeri ini Mereka tak mau kalah dengan kaum beragama lain Di negeri-negeri lain,

Here we explain about the complaint to God about the religious people in this country (Indonesia). Religious people in Indonesia do not want to lose to religious people in other countries. In the sense of constantly competing to be the most correct. The word 'in other countries' can be interpreted as in countries outside Indonesia, which are still in war in terms of religion. Because religious people in this country are considered to be rude, intolerant, and even anarchist. This is related to the value of religious moderation, namely tasamuh (tolerance). As religious people, humans should respect each other's differences, both between religions and within religions. In this poem, it can be seen that religious people do not apply the value of tasamuh (tolerance) in carrying out their religion.

## Tawazun (Balanced)

Jangan terpukau keindahannya saja Apalagi sampai dengan saudara-saudara sendiri bertikai Berebut tempat paling depan

The stanza of the poem contains a message of the meaning of religious moderation, which is don't get carried away in religion so that you fight with your own brothers and sisters to compete to be seen as the best / pious. This is in accordance with the tawazun (balanced) point, in the verse 'Don't just be amazed by its beauty', which refers to the message, don't just fall for the beauty of heaven/hereafter for those who are pious. Humans must keep a balance

between the world and the hereafter by doing just enough things (not excessive), providing a religious perspective as well as paying attention to justice, humanity, and equality.

Demi memperoleh rahmat-Mu Mereka memaafkan kesalahan Dan mendiamkan kemunakaran Bahkan mendukung kelaliman

They, the religious people in this country for the sake of obtaining God's grace, forgive mistakes, silence munkar, and support tyranny. That is, they are only oriented to worship God without caring about their surroundings. They let their other brothers and sisters in munkar which indirectly means they support tyranny. They only care about themselves. This is certainly not in accordance with the values of tawassuth and tawazun which put forward the principle of brotherhood (ukhuwah) and balance in firmness.

Untuk membuktikan keluhuran budi mereka Terhadap setan pun mereka tak pernah berburuk sangka.

Even in giving evidence to themselves, they never misbehaved with the devil. Even though this is clearly also the result of the devil's trick. Satan, when he fails to make humans evil, will certainly make humans feel that they are the best.

# I'tidal (perpendicular)

Humans must be able to put everything in its place, fulfill rights and obligations proportionally, and fairly. The portrait in the poem When Religion Loss God contains many values that are opposite to being upright. Humans today are seen as too "crooked" to understand and interpret religion.

Dulu agama menghancurkan berhala. Kini agama jadi berhala. Tak kenal tuhannya, yang penting agamanya.

In the sentence of this poem, it has been described that in this day and age there have been many incidents or events that have been damaged and the sense of tolerance and moderation destroyed, none other than the religion itself. Religion here is the main reason and cause, even now there are people who are religious but don't know who their god is, maybe there are many models like that in this world.

Dulu orang berhenti membunuh karena agama. Sekarang orang saling membunuh karena agama.

We know that people who were religious in the past knew that every religion forbade its followers to do heinous acts, let alone kill, because every religion has a goal of peace and in religious regulations it has been stated that killing is a very heinous act if there is no valid legal reason. However, nowadays there are many sects or groups (firqah) who commit heinous acts and commit murder, as has been done by sects or groups (firqah) lately, namely ISIS. One of the main causes of the killings is differences in understanding among human beings, which then religion is misused.

Dulu orang saling mengasihi karena beragama. Kini orang saling membenci karena beragama.

Based on the excerpt of the poem above, we can conclude that in the first sentence it states that people used to love each other and implies an attitude of tolerance and moderation, because we can interpret that in the first sentence it shows that they (the ancients) loved each other without discrimination, and mutual respect, However, the second snippet is very different from the first snippet of poetry, what is happening nowadays is that they are mutually hostile, hate each other, and fight each other, because their understanding is different.

Agama tak pernah berubah ajarannya dari dulu. Tuhannya pun tak pernah berubah dari dulu. Lalu apa yang berubah? Manusianya

The conclusion of this poem is that the understanding of people today is too extreme, because religious teachings are not deep enough to make a religion that was once known to be good and peaceful to become a religion to be feared. This is all caused by none other than the human being himself.

Esensi beragama telah dilupakan. Agama kini hanya komoditi yang menguntungkan pelaku bisnis berbasis agama, karena semua yang berbau agama telah didewa-dewakan, takkan pernah dianggap salah, tak pernah ditolak, dan jadi keperluan pokok melebihi sandang, pangan, papan. Agama jadi hobi, tren, dan bahkan pelarian karena tak tahu lagi mesti mengerjakan apa.

In today's life, there are so many religious people who use religion as a commodity. To the extent that it exceeds the need for clothing, food, and shelter. Even religion has now become a mediocre thing, a hobby, a slang trend to go viral, it's not just that, more and more religion is becoming an escape from religious people. We know that the essence of religion is actually how we carry out religious teachings in society and complement the divine values that have been taught from religion. It can be seen in the essence of religion which has actually shown the value of tolerance and moderation which is an attitude that we must always hold in society.

Tuhan mana yang mengajarkan tuk membunuh? Tuhan mana yang mengerjakan tuk membenci? Tapi manusia membunuh, membenci, merusak, mengintimidasi, sambil dengan bangga meneriakkan nama Tuhan, berfikir bahwa Tuhan sedang disenangkan Ketika ia menumpahkan darah manusia lainnya.

Religious people know that religion strictly forbids killing, but nowadays there are many incidents in the form of massacres and murders that put forward their religion or the group they belong to.

Agama dijadikan senjata tuk menghabisi manusia lainnya. Dan tanpa disadari manusia sedang merusak reputasi Tuhan, dan sedang mengubur Tuhan dalam-dalam dibalik gundukan ayat-ayat dan aturan agama.

Their actions have inadvertently deviated very far from what has been taught by religion, and their actions have unknowingly led to forgetting their god.

## **Against Religious Moderation**

The word 'Mereka bukan saja ikut menentukan ibadah tapi juga menetapkan siapa ke sorga siapa ke neraka' means that they even decide on others who deserves to go to heaven and who should go to hell. This is also in line with disbelieve in other people who oppose the value of religious moderation. They sanctify every one of their opinions in society. Even though they are not very familiar with religion, they only 'feel' close to God because they have built houses of worship. They are just big talk but actually empty/uncontained. This is expressed in the verse which reads 'Dan mereka akbarkan semua yang mereka lakukan hingga takbir dan ikrar mereka yang kosong bagai perut beduk'. So those who boast about the things they do, preach the good things they do, it just shows that in fact they are far from the pleasure of God. The phrase 'hingga takbir dan ikrar mereka yang kosong bagai perut beduk' has almost the same meaning as the proverbs 'tong kosong nyaring bunyinya' dan 'air beriak tanda tak dalam.

Poetry by KH. A. Mustofa Bisri implies a meaning in the womb in a song that is being sung by a person and his friends in the past or in childhood. In addition, the song is their favorite to the point that they are scrambling to sing it in front of the class. We can analyze in the snippet of the poem below:

Aku masih sangat hafal nyanyian itu.

Nyanyian kesayangan dan hafalan kita bersama, sejak kita di sekolah rakyat.

Kita berebut lebih dulu menyanyikan Ketika anak-anak disuruh menyanyi di depan kelas satu persatu

In this fragment we can conclude that the song in question is their favorite song in childhood. It can be seen in our favorite songs and by rote. And if we analyze based on the tolerance value, we will find the meaning of tolerance in the sentence we are scrambling to sing first. In this sentence, they visualize that they have mutual respect with the word scramble without any fighting words in the fragment of the poem. This means that they respect each other without causing any conflict even though they are scrambling to sing the song.

In the verse Ketika anak-anak disuruh menyanyi di depan kelas satu persatu, it shows a sense of moderation or an attitude that leads to an impartial dimension or middle ground. From before, the words scramble became words one by one. That the change in the word has the meaning of reconciling because something that is being contested without the value of moderation will cause conflicts or fights that would not actually occur if the moderate attitude had been applied.

Aku masih ingat betapa kita gembira, saat guru kita mengajak menyanyikan lagu itu bersama-sama.

The conclusion that can be analyzed in the fragment of the poem in terms of tolerance is the meaning that they sing the song together without discriminating against race, ethnicity, and religion.

Sudah lama sekali, peraaulan sudah tidak seakrab dulu laai, masina-masina sudah terseret kepentinaan sendiri atau tersihir pesona dunia.

Dan kau kini entah dimana, tapi masih sangat hafal nyanyian itu sayang.

Hari ini, ingin sekali aku menyanyikan Kembali bersamamu

The fragment of the poem shows that the song has not been sung together in a long time. And there arose a sense of longing to sing it together like before when we were still in public schools.

Aku merindukan rasa haru dan iba ditengah kobaran kebencian dan dendam serta maraknya rasa tega. Hingga kini ada saja yang mengubah lirik lagu kesayangan kit aitu dan menyanyikannya dengan nada sendu.

The data of the poem suggests that what is happening now is hatred and revenge, and implies that the values of tolerance and moderation are now getting lost or destroyed due to the rampant hatred and grudges as well as the heart that is happening in this day and age. In addition, in this poem by Gus Mus, the mark of the song is juxtaposed with the composition of the favorite song itself. We can also see that in the poem there are two songs that have the same tone, but different lyrics. It can be seen in the table below:

Nyanyian Asli	Nyanyian Gubahan
Indonesia tanah air beta	Indonesia air mata kita
Pusaka abadi nan jaya	Bahagia menjadi nestapa
Indonesia sejak dulu kala	Indonesia kini tiba-tiba
Selalu dipuja-puja bangsa	Selalu di hina hina bangsa
Di sana tempat lahir beta	Disana banyak orang lupa
Dibuai dibesarkan bunda	Dibuai kepentingan dunia
Tempat berlindung dihari tua	Tempat bertarung berebut kuasa
Sampai akhir menutup mata	

The composition in the song of the poem is found in the lyrics, namely Indonesia is the subject being discussed. In the original song, it is described that Indonesia is a peaceful and prosperous country and has a high sense of tolerance and moderation, even Indonesia is described as a beautiful place for us to grow old. However, in the song composition, Indonesia becomes an unpleasant place, full of riots, conflicts, lack of tolerance and moderation values, even just a place for power struggles. And also in the composition of the song, it implies that humans only care about themselves without the value of tolerance and moderation in themselves.

Sampai entah kapan akhirnya. Sayang di manakah kini kau

Mungkinkah kita menyanyi lagu kesayangan kita itu dengan akrab seperti dulu.

Finally, the poem describes a sense of ignorance about a meeting that is always missed as it used to be when he was in public school. In addition, the last sentence in the poem describes the emergence of a sense of anxiety about their intimacy, whether it can be like before.

## **Applications in Courses**

This poetry appreciation lesson using Gus Mus's poems with the theme of moderation was carried out in the fifth semester of the Indonesian Language Study Program, Faculty of Adab and Language, UIN Raden Mas Said Surakarta, which consisted of 4 classes. Each class consists of 31 students in class A, 30 students in class B, 31 students in class C, and 29 students in class D. The total number of students taking this course in 2022 is 121 students. Each class was given the task of reading Gus Mus's poems in their own style. Students who do not read poetry, are required to appreciate the poetry read by their friends by writing on the observation sheet containing the advantages, disadvantages, criticisms, suggestions, moderating values contained in the poem and an assessment of the reading. One example is in class 5A, which consists of 31 students, when one student reads Gus Mus's poem entitled Kaum Agama di Negri Ini, the other 30 students write down their appreciation on the observation sheet.

The results of the analysis show that the student observation sheet contains moderating values that must be developed. Statements, suggestions and input regarding the subjective reading of poetry by students colored the observation sheet. However, the value points of religious moderation are briefly described by students. The understanding of the concept of religious moderation is not fully understood by students in analyzing poetry. It is necessary to have a concrete understanding of the values of religious moderation before students can formulate them in poetry. This is because the language of poetry is polyinterpretable. Students' experiences, insights, knowledge and reading sources determine the extent to which students' meaning and appreciation are carried out.

## Conclusion

Based on the explanation of the analysis of Gus Mus's poems with the theme of moderation, several conclusions can be drawn. The principles of religious moderation in poetry are tawwasuth, tasamuh, tawazun, and I'tidal. In addition to the four principles that are in line with moderation, there are also principles that oppose religious moderation. These five things color the concept of religious moderation from the five poems taken as objects of research. In addition, in relation to learning, students feel happy reading and appreciating A. Mustofa Bisri's poetry which is full of moderation. However, a concrete understanding of religious moderation in poetry is needed. The results of observation and appreciation still depend on the experience, insight, knowledge, and reading sources of students. Moreover, literary works that are multi-interpreted.

## Acknowledgements

Thanks are conveyed to the lecturers who are in charge of the Poetry Appreciation Study course who have provided a lot of information about this lecture both through interviews and observations of learning in class. Thanks are also conveved to the students who took these courses in the fifth semester of 2022 from class A to class D who have provided information and collected assignments according to the topic for the continuation of this research. In addition, thanks were also conveyed to the research assistants in the field who patiently collected data for data, sorting, and re-excavating data that were not in-depth.

## **Funding**

This research was independently funded by researchers in order to carry out their duties as lecturers and complete the Tri Dharma of Higher Education. In addition, this research is also intended to try to internalize religious moderation into study programs, in this case literature. Through this research, it is hoped that it can support the continuity of poetry appreciation learning and become an evaluation material for the preparation of RPS and lecture action plans in 2023 at the Indonesian Language Tadris Study Program, Faculty of Adab and Language, UIN Raden Mas Said Surakarta.

#### References

Ali, N. (2020). Measuring Religious Moderation Among Muslim Students at Public Colleges in Kalimantan Facing Disruption Era. Inferensi: Jurnal Penelitian Sosial Keagamaan, 14. https://doi.org/10.18326/infsl3.v14i1.1-24.

Amrin, A., Muthoifin, M., Shobron, S., & Pembangunan, H. R. P. (2020). Islamic Values of the Peta Kapanca Tradition at the Mbojo Tribe's Marriage, West Nusa Tenggara, Indonesia. Cakrawala: Jurnal Studi Islam, 15(2), 93-104. https://doi.org/10.31603/cakrawala.3405

Baidi, Pembangunan, H. R. P., & Junaidah. (2020). The effect of leadership style and work motivation on work productivity for teachers in all state junior high schools of surakarta. Universal Journal of Educational Research, 8(3D), 67-72. https://doi.org/10.13189/ujer.2020.081710

Dimyati, A. (2018). Moderasi Islam Perspektif Ahmad Mustofa Bisri. Institut PTIQ.

Fernando, R., Hasanuddin, T., Rangga, K. K., & Utama, D. D. P. (2022). Professional Mosque Management Model Based on Religious and Academic Activities in the Community. Khalifa: Journal of Islamic Education, 6(2), 196-216.

- Hasan, K. (2020). Relationship Of Professionalism With Religious Moderation In Islamic Religious Education Teachers. At-Tarbiyat: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam, 3(2), 119-130. http://jurnal.staiannawawi.com/index.php/At-Tarbiyat/article/view/223
- Herlinawati, H. (2020). The Integration of Religious Moderation Values in Islamic Religious Education Learning at Public Universities (Efforts and Constraints in the Implementation of Anti-Radicalism Education. Syamsil: Journal of Islamic Education, 8(2). https://doi.org/10.21093/sy.v8i2.2643
- Naj'ma, D. B. A. dan S. B. (2021). Pendidikan Moderasi Beragama Dalam Penguatan Wawasan Kebangsaan. Academica : Journal of Multidisciplinary Studies, 5(2).
- Suryadi, R. A. (2022). Implementasi Moderasi Beragama dalam Pendidikan Agama Islam. Taklim: Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam, *20*(1).
- Ulistiani, L., Solahudin, Di., & Ridwan, A. (2018). Pesan Dakwah dalam Puisi Gus Mus. Prophetica: Scientific and Research Journal of Islamic Communication and Broadcasting, 4(1).
- Yanti, B. Z. dan D. W. (2020). Islamic Moderation as A Resolution of Different Conflicts of Religion. Andragogi: Jurnal Diklat Teknis Pendidikan Dan Keagamaan, 8(1). https://doi.org/10.36052/andragogi.v8i1.127.